



SDMS DocID 2142770

PFE ORIGINAL



Fw: Scranton Times-Tribune (1-28) In Dimock, EPA testing draws mixed reaction

Cecil Rodrigues to: Helen Duteau, Michael Kulik, Walter Wilkie

01/31/2012 09:00 AM

Cecil Rodrigues
Eric Wachter

----- Original Message -----

From: Eric Wachter

Sent: 01/30/2012 05:50 PM EST

To: Bob Sussman; Shawn Garvin

Cc: Amy Johansen; Betsaida Alcantara; Cecil Rodrigues; "Dandrea Michael" <dandrea.michael@epa.gov>; Daniel Ryan; Dennis Carney; "Jerry Heston" <heston.gerald@epa.gov>; Janice Donlon; Jennie Saxe; Kathy Hodgkiss; Mathy Stanislaus; Ron Borsellino; William Early

Subject: Re: Scranton Times-Tribune (1-28) In Dimock, EPA testing draws mixed reaction

Attached is a copy of the letter that we received today. We will assign these to R3 for response as we have been doing for Dimock letters. Let me know if you need anything else. Thanks.



Residents of Dimock.pdf - Adobe Acrobat.pdf

Bob Sussman

Adding Eric to help track it down. Robert M. Sus...

01/29/2012 10:16:25 AM

From: Bob Sussman/DC/USEPA/US
To: Shawn Garvin/R3/USEPA/US@EPA
Cc: Amy Johansen/R3/USEPA/US@EPA, Betsaida Alcantara/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Cecil Rodrigues/R3/USEPA/US@EPA, "Dandrea Michael" <dandrea.michael@epa.gov>, Daniel Ryan/R3/USEPA/US@EPA, Dennis Carney/R3/USEPA/US@EPA, "Jerry Heston" <heston.gerald@epa.gov>, Janice Donlon/R3/USEPA/US@EPA, Jennie Saxe/R3/USEPA/US@EPA, Kathy Hodgkiss/R3/USEPA/US@EPA, Mathy Stanislaus/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Ron Borsellino/R3/USEPA/US@EPA, William Early/R3/USEPA/US, Eric Wachter/DC/USEPA/US@EPA
Date: 01/29/2012 10:16 AM
Subject: Re: Scranton Times-Tribune (1-28) In Dimock, EPA testing draws mixed reaction

Adding Eric to help track it down.

Robert M. Sussman
 Senior Policy Counsel to the Administrator
 Office of the Administrator
 US Environmental Protection Agency

Shawn Garvin

Bob: I suspect it is somewhere in HQ, we have...

01/29/2012 10:15:04 AM

From: Shawn Garvin/R3/USEPA/US
To: Bob Sussman/DC/USEPA/US@EPA
Cc: Amy Johansen/R3/USEPA/US@EPA, Betsaida Alcantara/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Cecil Rodrigues/R3/USEPA/US@EPA, "Dandrea Michael" <dandrea.michael@epa.gov>, Daniel Ryan/R3/USEPA/US@EPA, Dennis Carney/R3/USEPA/US@EPA, "Jerry Heston" <heston.gerald@epa.gov>, Janice Donlon/R3/USEPA/US@EPA, Jennie Saxe/R3/USEPA/US@EPA, Kathy Hodgkiss/R3/USEPA/US@EPA, Mathy Stanislaus/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Ron Borsellino/R3/USEPA/US@EPA, William Early/R3/USEPA/US

Date: 01/29/2012 10:15 AM
Subject: Re: Scranton Times-Tribune (1-28) In Dimock, EPA testing draws mixed reaction

Bob - I suspect it is somewhere in HQ, we have not seen it yet in the Region. I am interested in seeing it as soon as you can track down. Let me know.

Thanks - Shawn

Bob Sussman

----- Original Message -----

From: Bob Sussman
Sent: 01/29/2012 10:10 AM EST
To: Shawn Garvin
Cc: Amy Johansen; Betsaida Alcantara; Cecil Rodrigues; "Dandrea Michael" <dandrea.michael@epa.gov>; Daniel Ryan; Dennis Carney; "Jerry Heston" <heston.gerald@epa.gov>; Janice Donlon; Jennie Saxe; Kathy Hodgkiss; Mathy Stanislaus; Ron Borsellino; William Early
Subject: Re: Scranton Times-Tribune (1-28) In Dimock, EPA testing draws mixed reaction
Can someone provide the letter to the administrator? We will want to respond.

Robert M. Sussman
Senior Policy Counsel to the Administrator
Office of the Administrator
US Environmental Protection Agency

Shawn Garvin	Dennis - Thanks. I knew we were moving more t...	01/28/2012 12:28:07 PM
Dennis Carney		

----- Original Message -----

From: Dennis Carney
Sent: 01/28/2012 10:58 AM EST
To: Shawn Garvin; Ron Borsellino; Kathy Hodgkiss; William Early; Bob Sussman; Mathy Stanislaus; Betsaida Alcantara; Jennie Saxe; Cecil Rodrigues
Cc: Daniel Ryan; "Mike D'Andrea" <dandrea.michael@epa.gov>; Amy Johansen; Janice Donlon; "Jerry Heston" <heston.gerald@epa.gov>
Subject: Re: Scranton Times-Tribune (1-28) In Dimock, EPA testing draws mixed reaction

Shawn, the action memo actually uses the phase approximately 61 homes. This was because we knew there were a few more homes in the area but we had not yet surveyed them. Now that we are back working in the community we have surveyed the final few homes. In fact 4 of the additional homes are ones where sampling was at one time performed by Cabot and/or PADEP. Thanks, Dennis.

Shawn Garvin

----- Original Message -----

From: Shawn Garvin
Sent: 01/28/2012 10:21 AM EST
To: Ron Borsellino; Kathy Hodgkiss; Dennis Carney; William Early; Bob Sussman; Mathy Stanislaus; Betsaida Alcantara; Jennie Saxe; Cecil Rodrigues
Cc: Daniel Ryan; "Dandrea Michael" <dandrea.michael@epa.gov>; Amy Johansen; Janice Donlon
Subject: Fw: Scranton Times-Tribune (1-28) In Dimock, EPA testing draws mixed reaction

Has anyone seen the letter referred to in the article from some residents to the Administrator? Also, where did the 66 home number come from? Thanks

Roy Seneca

----- Original Message -----

From: Roy Seneca

Sent: 01/28/2012 08:01 AM EST

To: schaffer.joan@epa.gov; white.terri-a@epa.gov; Michael Kulik; Ron Borsellino; Shawn Garvin; William Early; Daniel Ryan; Michael Dandrea; Kathy Hodgkiss; Dennis Carney; Gerald Heston; Richard Fetzer; Richard Rupert; Helen Duteau; Trish Taylor; Alexander Mandell; Jennie Saxe; Stacie Driscoll; David Sternberg; Cecil Rodrigues; Heather Gray; Humane Zia; Walter Wilkie; Lora Werner; Jon Capacasa; KarenD Johnson; Victoria Binetti; Thomas Damm; Bonnie Smith; William Smith; Jessica Greathouse; Dawn Ioven; JohnJ Butler

Subject: Scranton Times-Tribune (1-28) In Dimock, EPA testing draws mixed reaction

In Dimock, EPA testing draws mixed reaction

By LAURA LEGERE

DIMOCK TWP. - Two teams of scientists sampling well water from four homes a day are producing a picture of the aquifer under this Susquehanna County town that will help define the impact of natural gas drilling on drinking water.

The water captured in vials and packed in coolers by scientists and contractors for the Environmental Protection Agency since Jan. 23 is the heart of an investigation spurred by concerns that Cabot Oil & Gas Corp.'s Marcellus Shale drilling and hydraulic fracturing tainted water wells.

In a divided village where gas drilling is as earnestly embraced as it is criticized, the controversy over the EPA's fieldwork started before the sampling did. Test results are at least five weeks away.

The study has provoked strong criticism from the industry and its local supporters who accuse the EPA of meddling in what they consider a settled matter or a spectacle conjured by lawyers.

At the same time, the study has earned the grateful support of families, many of whom are suing Cabot, who have used their water warily or not at all since methane tied to drilling first intruded in 2008.

State officials determined faulty Cabot gas wells allowed methane to seep into 18 Dimock water supplies in 2009, but Cabot water tests from last fall raised federal regulators' concern about the potential health threats posed by other contaminants in the water.

The contaminants - some of which are naturally occurring but all of which are associated with natural gas drilling, the EPA said - include arsenic, barium, the plasticizer commonly called DEHP, glycol compounds, manganese, phenol and sodium.

"If we see an immediate threat to public health, we will not hesitate to take steps under the law to protect Americans whose health may be at risk," EPA spokeswoman Terri White said.

Residents who support Cabot's operations sent a letter to EPA Administrator Lisa Jackson this week calling for her to "rein in" the "rogue regional office" in Philadelphia that is leading the investigation based on what they said were "baseless claims" and "hyped-up allegations" of pollutants that occur naturally in the region.

The group, Enough is Enough, created a campaign called "Dimock Proud" with yard signs, a petition drive and a logo: "Where the water IS clean and the people are friendly."

The petition to Ms. Jackson was bundled with an earlier petition signed by more than 400 Susquehanna County residents and sent to the state to ask for Cabot to be able to resume drilling in a 9-square-mile section of Dimock - where EPA is now testing - that has been off limits to the driller since 2010. The moratorium has continued because the state has not determined that the company's wells have stopped leaking methane.

"The Philadelphia Regional Office's action in enabling this litigation threatens our livelihoods and is destroying our community reputation," the residents wrote to Ms. Jackson. "These actions are an assault on our property rights and basic freedoms."

Cabot CEO Dan Dinges cited President Barack Obama's support for domestic natural gas in his State of the Union address when he also wrote to Ms. Jackson this week. Her agency's actions in Dimock "appear to undercut the President's stated commitment to this important resource," Mr. Dinges wrote.

In another statement released this week, the company said it "is concerned that this recent action may be more of an attempt to advance a political agenda hostile to shale gas development rather than a principled effort to address environmental concerns in the area."

The industry group Energy in Depth posted historical state and federal data on its website showing some of the pollutants that triggered the EPA investigation - manganese and arsenic - occur in the geological formation that is used for groundwater in Dimock. It cited a 2006 U.S. Geological Survey study that found arsenic in 18 of 143 domestic water wells it sampled in Northeast Pennsylvania, although none of the samples taken in Susquehanna or Wyoming counties detected the compound.

The arsenic level that triggered the EPA to truck water to one home in Dimock was nearly four times the federal standard.

The EPA rebuffed Cabot's criticism this week, saying its actions "are guided entirely by science and the law."

"We are providing water to a handful of households because data developed by Cabot itself provides evidence that they are being exposed to hazardous substances at levels of health concern," the agency said. "We are conducting monitoring as a prudent step to investigate these concerns and develop a sound scientific basis for assessing the need for further action."

While the Mr. Obama's address made clear his support for domestic natural gas extraction, the agency added, "he also affirmed our commitment to 'developing this resource without putting the health and safety of our citizens at risk.'"

Despite some residents' skepticism of the EPA's actions, the agency has received permission from 55 of the 66 Dimock homes it approached to conduct sampling, spokesman Roy Seneca said Friday. The EPA has not received a final response from 11 of the 66 homes. Its initial goal was to take samples from about 61 homes.

"I'm thrilled the EPA is here," resident Victoria Switzer said Friday as five scientists wearing blue gloves huddled on a mound of melting snow in her backyard where her well water trickled from a spigot.

If the test comes back clear, she said, "I'll be very relieved that our water is safe to use and we can go on living in our home."

The water sampling will also provide key data for the future, she said.

"I'm considering it baseline testing for the next wave when Cabot roars back in here."

Contact the writer: llegere@timeshamrock.com

Read more:

<http://thetimes-tribune.com/news/in-dimock-epa-testing-draws-mixed-reaction-1.1263956#ixzz1kkxdWBvA>

Roy Seneca
EPA Region 3 Press Officer
Office of Public Affairs
seneca.roy@epa.gov
(215) 814-5567

ENOUGH IS ENOUGH - DIMOCK RESIDENTS

PO Box 43
DIMOCK, PA 18816
570-965-0943

1/30 248 30 PM

REC

2012 JAN 30 PM 1:02

EXECUTIVE SECRET

January 24, 2012

The Honorable Lisa Jackson
Office of the Administrator
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
Room 3000, Ariel Rios Federal Building
1200 Pennsylvania Ave., NW
Washington, DC 20460

Dear Administrator Jackson:


Enclosed, for your consideration, please find original signed statements from residents of Dimock and surrounding townships.

We are extremely frustrated with the actions of your Philadelphia Regional Office. We are being treated as expendable in a continuing effort by just 11 landowners to make financial claims against Cabot Oil and Gas. These claims have already been rebuffed by the Pennsylvania Department of Environmental Protection and the Commonwealth's Environmental Hearing Board after three full years of data gathering. Now, just as we thought the worst was over, your agency inserts itself into the matter at the request, not of the Commonwealth or the community, but trial lawyers, giving further credence to the baseless claims of their clients.

The facts are simple. Cabot and our DEP entered into an agreement to resolve outstanding issues regarding some of its early wells. Cabot met these terms and DEP, therefore, released Cabot from its obligations to deliver water to affected homeowners. These homeowners have been offered both treatment systems and financial settlements, which several accepted and are pleased with. Water tests indicate the treatment systems work and the Philadelphia Regional Office acknowledged there was no safety hazard as recently as a few weeks ago. However, the litigants are now complaining their wells have been affected by other contaminants. They have obtained legal counsel, hosted activist film-maker Josh Fox and have continually advanced a false narrative through activists and the media while refusing any, and all, assistance offered by Cabot and DEP, as well as participation in the national water study your agency is conducting. They have also failed to allow regular testing and monitoring of their water supplies, although such tests as have been allowed reveal no case where your primary drinking water standards are not met.

The Philadelphia Regional Office's action in enabling this litigation threatens our livelihoods and is destroying our community reputation. Worse, EPA is relying upon hyped-up allegations regarding arsenic, manganese and sodium, all of which are known to be naturally occurring in our water supplies in Northeastern Pennsylvania. Even more outrageous is the twisting of EPA's Superfund authority, intended to help clean up abandoned hazardous waste sites, into a weapon for use by trial lawyers in bludgeoning Cabot for what is a non-issue. These actions are an assault on our property rights and basic freedoms. We urge you to rein in this rogue Regional Office.

Respectfully submitted,
The Residents of Dimock

Clyde LaRue, Jr 1-25-2012


Att: Petition to the United States Environmental Protection Agency

cc: The Honorable Michael Krancer, Pennsylvania Department of Environmental Protection
The Honorable Pat Toomey, United States Senator
The Honorable Bob Casey, United States Senator
The Honorable Tom Marino, United States Congress
The Honorable Tom Corbett, Governor, Pennsylvania
The Honorable Michael Krancer, Secretary, Pennsylvania Department of Environmental Protection

COMMENT: I HAVE LIVED in Dimock Twp for
MOST OF MY 63 yrs. + I POSSITIVELY KNOW THERE
HAVE BEEN WATER WELL PROBLEMS in THE CARTER
ROAD AREA SINCE I WAS A KID. I ALSO FEEL
THAT THE WATER WELLS you TEST SHOULD BE
FLUSHED + LOCKED BEFORE THEY ARE TESTED
SO THERE IS NO CHANCE THAT THEY ARE TAMPERED
WITH + THE TESTS ARE ACCURATE AS OF THAT DAY.
Respectfully submitted,

NAME:

CLYDE LAROE, JR

ADDRESS:

Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy

Signature:

Clyde Laroe Jr

Clyde LaRue

Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy

SCRANTON PA 185

25 APR 2012 PM 11



The Honorable Lisa Jackson, EPA
Office of the Administrator
Room 3000, Ariel Rios Federal Building
1200 Pennsylvania Ave., NW
Washington, DC 20460

